Emerging Dimensions in Transformative Learning: New Insights in Research and Practice for Adult Educators.

Hussayn Umar Idris PhD
Department of Educational Foundations
Faculty of Education
University of Jos
yesminama@yahoo.co.uk

Garba M Tofa PhD
Department of Adult Education and Extension Services
Faculty of Education
Bayero University Kano
Kano City
gmtofa@gmail.com

Abiodun Deborah Yetunde PhD
Department of Educational Foundation
Faculty of Education
University of Jos
Izrahiah2002@gmail.com

Abstract: *This paper discusses the continued relevance of transformative learning theory over time coupled with the emerging dimensions of new insights through which are re-invented the theory of transformative learning, this reinvention provides justification enough for a review by the authors, owing to transformation's ability to radically alter in a positive way the life of adults in a post pandemic era. Inequalities across the globe highlighted the fact that efforts have not been placed in proper perspective to address the widening gap between the upper and lower classes, this points to why this theory remains continually relevant. This has made it abundantly necessary to undertake a review of the core contributions of Jack Mezirow's transformative learning theory. This is followed by a description and discussion of other emerging learning concepts developing out of the transformative learning theory, the most germane are the neurobiological, cultural-spiritual, race-centric, and planetary ideas. Relevant theories that thoroughly review these new concepts are further perused by highlighting their contributions to Adult education and enunciating the possible implications of their implementation to practitioners in the field as the attempt to foster learning amongst adults.*

Keywords: Transformative learning, adult education, post-pandemic, teaching.

Introduction

An instinctive drive exists among human beings to constantly search for ways to create and add meanings to their daily lives. That the only constancy in life is change, this goes to prove that there are no absolute or enduring truths, we cannot, therefore, always be assured that what we know, believe or hold to be true will remain so forever. Human beings, therefore, in their day-to-day interaction will need to develop a more critical or discerning view of life to better understands the world (Taylor, 2008). The capacity to learn new skills that enable "negotiating and acting upon our purposes, values, feelings and meanings rather than those we have uncritically assimilated from others" becomes important in adult life (Mezirow and Associates, 2000, p. 8).

The need by adult learners to develop beliefs that they can rely on, explore and validate such beliefs and therefrom taking decisions are important skills adult learners need in their learning process. Transformation as a process of constructing and appropriating new and revised interpretations of the meaning of experiences in the world is a skill Taylor, (2008) concluded is needed by adults.

In (1978) a uniquely adult perspective to interpreting, understanding and explaining how to cope with life was introduced by Mezirow called transformative learning which was geared towards essentially helping adult learners perceive and interpret their world, where "learning is understood as the process of using a prior interpretation to construe a new or revised interpretation of the meaning of one's experience in order to guide future action" (Mezirow, 1996, p. 162). Transformation is hinged on a frame of reference (Taylor, 2008).

The structures through which assumptions and expectations are held and defined are referred to as frames, through these frames people define the tacit points of view that direct and influence their thinking, beliefs, and actions (Taylor, 2008). That frames of mind can be revised in concert with reflecting on experiences is addressed by the theory of perspective transformation—a paradigmatic shift. Taylor, 2008 opined that these leads to "a more fully developed (more functional) frame of reference . . . one that is more:
(a) Inclusive,
(b) Differentiating,
(c) Permeable,
(d) Critically reflective, and
(e) Integrative of experience" (Mezirow, 1996, p. 163).
This kind of transformation is not automatic but occurs after series of cumulatively transformed meaning, schemes or as a result of an acute personal or social crisis, for example, a natural disaster, the death of a significant other, divorce, a debilitating accident, war, job loss, or retirement amongst others.

Painful and stressful experiences may enable people to begin a critical reexamination of the core values of their lives (Mezirow, 1997). Adeyanju Ojuola a western Nigerian transiting to the Northern part of Nigeria for the very first time presents an interesting and almost intriguing example of a perspective transformation, as she relates her interesting discoveries when she relocated to Northern Nigeria:

> I was very sheltered before [moving]. I think it made me aware of the fact that there are people who do things differently. There are different cultures…I tended to look at things a lot more basic…People are the same all over the world to a certain extent. You go to work. You do your daily job. I tended not to be so narrow minded……. What I really thought about the Northern Nigeria was how shallow, how provincial…..We didn't know anything about other cultures, we were so isolated. We always thought we were the best. I was starting to think that maybe we weren't the best, because we are missing out on so much. When you're living in Northern Nigeria, you're exposed to so many different languages and cultures and so much history and beauty that we miss out on here. We are isolated, so I started to think of my zone as not being number one anymore [Hussayn and Ahmadu 2016].

Core to Adeyanju's transformation is her intercultural experience, reflecting critically on engaging herself in a reflection of her findings in a dialoguos relationship with herself. The reason for this self-reflection on her part is hinged on the difficulty she encountered while trying to adjust to her new life in Northern Nigeria: "[Shared] learning experiences establish a common base from which each learner constructs meaning through personal reflection and group discussion the meanings that learners attach to their experiences may be subjected to critical scrutiny" (Taylor, 2008, Tennant, 1991, p. 197).

Transformation can only be possible when an individual critically scrutinizes, reflects or indulges in a conscious, explicit review or reassessment of the effect and ancestral origin of the meanings we ascribe to our beliefs (Taylor, 2008). It "is a process by which we attempt to justify our beliefs, either by rationally examining assumptions, often in response to intuitively becoming aware that something is wrong with the result of our thought or challenging its validity through discourse with others of differing viewpoints and arriving at the best-informed judgment" (Mezirow, 1995, p. 46). In discussing with others in the host Northern Nigeria Adeyanju's values and norms became the standard of promoting and developing her transformation (Taylor, 2008). Contrasted with everyday discussion, this mode of dialogue is employed "when we have reason to question the comprehensibility, truth, appropriateness (in relation to norms), or authenticity (in relation to feelings) of what is being asserted" (Mezirow, 1991, p. 77). When we engage in continuous and varying interfaces with others, we, like Adeyanju will develop the tendency to interrogate whatever unbiased conclusions we have developed about our cultures in comparative relationship to the host culture. Transformation as a learning theory has since its debut in the early 1980's given rise to development of other learning theories that could be perused as alternate academic concepts and a rich library about both the fundamental basis of transformative learning and the application of transformative learning in practice and theory.

Alternative Conceptions of Transformative Learning

Universally Mezirow's psycho-critical view of transformative learning enjoys wide acceptance across practitioners and theorists, this universal acceptance has led to the belief in most quarters that there is only one

theory of transformative learning, scholars such as Taylor (2008) opined that Mezirow's psycho-critical theory overshadowed other theoretical conceptions. Even though scholars have in the past tried to make sense of other perspectives. (Dirkx, 1998; Taylor, 1998), with limited successes, it can be argued, that, there exist a host of alternative conceptions of transformative learning theory that explains similar ideas and address factors not fully understood or explained by dominant transformative theory (Mezirow's), such as spirituality, positionality, emancipatory learning, and neurobiology. Taylor (2008) asserted that what is most exciting about Mariam's position is the possibility of this diversity of theoretical perspectives potential to offer a more diverse interpretation of transformative learning and the significant implications it has for practice (Taylor, 2008, Merriam, 2001), identified and discussed three alternative transformative theories in addition to Mezirow's psycho-critical perspective of transformative learning: psychoanalytic, psycho-developmental and psycho-emancipatory.

- *Psychoanalytic view;* this approach to transformative learning is perused as a process of individuation, through which an individual gets to understand his/her personality by undergoing a deep reflection of the psychological dispositions (ego, shadow, persona, collective unconscious, and so on) that constitutes the collective composition of a person's identity (Taylor, 2008). This entails a process of discovery of new talents, traits, leading to self-empowerment, confidence and deeper understanding of one's inner self, and a greater sense of self-responsibility (Boyd and Meyers, 1988; Cranton, 2000; Dirkx, 2000).
- *Psycho-developmental;* on the hand encompasses an individual's effort in trying on a continuous basis to make meaning out of life through a continuous and incremental reflection; it is also seen as progressive growth by the individuals involved (Taylor, 2008). Epistemological change is a necessary condition for this view of transformation (manifested in a dynamic approach to how we make meaning), not necessarily noticed in the quantity of cognitive development, as a corollary to this an appreciation of the development of the individuals ability to build, nurture and maintain relationships, exercise influences, and possess a robust knowledge in a rounded manner, often overlooked in Mezirow's rational emphasis on transformation (Daloz, 1986; Kegan, 1994).

Mezirow's psycho-critical transformative learning like the two perspectives discussed above places significant emphasis on the role of the individual leaving little or no room for the social and contextual circumstances under which an individual operates. Consequent upon which it is necessary to review a third perspective.

- *Social-emancipatory* view, this perspective assumes that little by little people start to assumes roles that allow them address their own concerns, in a small way people start to discourse and undertake actions to solve their problems themselves, this paradigmatic approach is rooted in the works of Freire (1984), it takes an "ontological vocation" (p, 12), drawn from an existential theory that perceives people as subjects rather than as objects, in a continuous reflection and taking actions necessary for the transformation of their world with a view to making it a better place. The underlying goal is to through social transformative learning that demysthicize reality by encouraging the oppressed develop ability to think critically and not be content to accept other peoples view naively.

Freire and Macedo, (1995) concluded that these three dimensions are a necessary condition for the development of emancipatory transformative learning.

- Critical reflection geared towards helping adult learners identify the source and location of power and all agencies needed for the transformation of society and the benefit to all, altering their own reality is the central goal.
- As a corollary to the above teaching is perused as not just acts of cognition built merely around the transfer of knowledge but as a problem-posing and problem-solving exercise with the sole purpose to liberate learners through developing and operating a dialogical methodology.
- Finally, the teacher=student relationship is developed alongside a horizontal and not a hierarchical manner with the teacher seen as working as a political agent with the student on an equal manner.

The addition of four views to the transformative dialogue has further broadened the intellectual discourse in addition to the previously analysed ones these according to Taylor, (2008) are:

- neurobiological,
- cultural-spiritual,
- race-centric,
- planetary)

The *neurobiological* perspective of transformative learning according to (Janik, 2005) clinicians working on patients recovering from brain injury or psychological trauma through employing medical imaging discovered

what Janik (2005) preferred to call "brain-based theory" of learning. The researchers concluded that a neurobiological transformation is possible by invoking secreting endocrine system to alter learning during periods of search and discovery" (Janik, 2007, p. 12). While patients are recovering from traumatic experiences, they are faced with a painful process of self-rediscovery that could trigger life changing decisions. The study concluded that the brain structure changes during the learning process. The scholar's questions traditional models of learning such as (behaviorism, cognitivism & constructivism) and instead offer a distinctive neurobiological, physically based pathway to transformative learning (Taylor, 2008). From this angle we see learning as a "volitional, curiosity-based, discovery-driven, and mentor-assisted" activity that could be very effective at advanced intellectual level (Janik, 2005, p. 144). This methodology opines that transformative learning;

  i. involves anxiety prior to discovery;
  ii. Is based on students' familiarities, needs, and interests;
  iii. Is reinforced by emotional, corporeal, and kinesthetic experiences;
  iv. Appreciates differences in learning between males and females, and
  v. Demands that educators acquire an understanding of a unique discourse and knowledge base of neurobiological systems.

Cultural-spiritual views of transformative learning (Brooks, 2000; Tisdell, 2003) are focused on the "links between learners and the social structures . . . and opinions on interconnecting positionalities" (Tisdell, 2005, p. 256). From this angle attention is directed at how learners create understanding (narratives) as part of the transformative learning experience. Essentially importance is placed on an approach that respects a culturally relevant and spiritually grounded transformative pedagogy.

  Developing/fostering a narrative transformation—engaging storytelling from a purely personal and social point of view involving group inquiry is encouraged. The ability to develop relationships across cultures/spiritual awareness is skills that are encouraged in learners. The teacher here is perceived as a collaborator with emphasis on fostering group relationship, a sense of inquiry and descriptive cognitive bond among members, with the hope of developing in members the willingness to share and revise experience

Race-centric view of transformative learning emphasizes the need for people especially minorities, marginalized groups, often women, and most particularly black women, the focus of this perspective of transformative learning are the subjects of the transformation (Williams, 2003), the emphasis for transformative learning employing this perspective focuses on race as the unit of analysis while emphasizing the political orientation of both learners and learning goals. As opined in the emancipatory viewpoint postulated by Freire, the language related to transformative learning is always not employed: "Traditionally, education in Africa has always had a transformative orientation. Rites of passage and rituals (circumcision rites, initiation rites, age grade etc) are among the many forms transformative learning through which Africans nurture the consciousness of every member of society into a greater connection with the Self, the Community, and the Universe" (p. 463).

  From this point of view transformative learning develops a cultural bond that is oppositional, and non-individualistic with the self. Involving the polyrhythmic realities is important for this perspective of learning—"students' existential realities experience in their sociopolitical, cultural, and historical context" are the theoretical content for development (Sheared, 1994, p. 36). Added, to this are concepts in developing transformative and inclusive learning: (empowering the historically disenfranchised) and promoting belonginess rather than self-actualization while ensuring equity and not just equality for all cultural members), and all life skill is learnt between and across cultures. Developing transformative learning can be perused as creating a deliberate and conscious strategy in engaging a political framework (consciousness raising, activism, fostering a safe learning environment) with the expectation that it "may be necessary for one to undergo some form of self-reflection and transformation in order to teach transformation" (Johnson-Bailey and Alfred, 2006, p. 55). Some of the concerns raised by Brookfield (2003) could be addressed by this conception of transformative learning grounding.

A *planetary* **view this** perspective of transformative learning focuses on attempting to understand life beyond and above the realm of the individual and proposes to address issues in the field of education (O'Sullivan, 1999). The overriding aim of transformative education from this perspective is to attempt a holistic review of the complete system (political, social, and educational), by developing an entirely novel and germane individual, functional and entrenched in technological values of an emerging development culture. The interconnected relationship existing between and among the universe is the fundamental focus here, (planet, natural

environment, human community, and personal world). The individual is to be perceived and most importantly he should perceive himself from a socio-political dimension as well as an ecological and planetary one.

Change is importantly more than how we perceive our human counterparts; understanding how humans relate with the physical world view is paramount and necessarily connected to our effective transformation. There are important differences though, the different ways we transform, the goal of transformation and most fundamentally different is that of personal or emancipatory transformation (self-actualization to planetary consciousness).

Connected to the expected benefits described above is its emphasis on change at the individual or social level. Apart from this perspective all the notions espoused by the other perspectives are embedded in the individual level (psycho-critical, psychoanalytic, psycho-developmental and, neuro-biological) little or no attention is paid to context and social change and whatever impact it has on relationship to transformation. Here both individual and society are perceived as one indivisible entity (emancipatory, race-centric, and cultural-spiritual), transformative learning is premised on social change as individual transformation and the role of culture in transformative learning.

Some scholars place particular emphasis on (social emancipatory, culturally relevant narrative, race-centric, and planetary) positionality (an individual's "location" in relation to social status, race, gender, sexual orientation, religion) regarding the process and practice of transformative learning.

Allied to the emergence of other thoughts on transformative learning, (Taylor, 2007), opined that some implications exist for the implementation of transformative learning in a classroom situation, pointing out that even though these research were carried out in higher institutions of learning it is worthy to understand the findings and how they affect transformative learning generally, for example he postulated that new direction in transformation is tilting towards a higher more general concern and interest growing on the conditions shaping and directing the transformative experience.

The concept of "perspective transformation," as enunciated earlier is seen to be as enduring as it is irreversible (Courtenay, Merriam, and Reeves, 1998). Recent studies have emphasized and reaffirmed the connection between action and perspective transformation (MacLeod, Parkin, Pullon, and Robertson, 2003). Lange (2004) concluded that the connection between developing citizens that will act to develop a society alongside sustainable tenets to be not just an epistemological conversion but more of an ontological shift, manifesting/ displaying a habitual interest in acting on the identified perception. Several other scholars stress the need to create openings for learners both inside and outside the classroom to develop and act on new insights in the transformative learning process. The place of experiences in testing and transforming new perspectives is greatly emphasized.

The role of critical thinking/serious reflection to transformative learning is important as it sheds light on the nature of reflection, indicators of reflection, joint reflection through peer dialogue, and factors that help explain non-reflection (Taylor, 2008). In recognizing levels of reflection using categories developed by Mezirow (content, process, premise), Kreber (2004) concluded that when teaching, educators may begin with foundation reflection—that is, being more concerned with *why* they teach than with how or what they teach. Premise refers to a tendency to "question our presuppositions that underlie our knowledge" (p. 31). Critical reflection could be seen as evolving a process engrained in experience, that gives credibility to Merriam's position (2004) that "mature cognitive development is foundational to engaging in critical reflection and rational discourse necessary for transformative learning" (p. 65). These findings, for educators suggest the need to involve learners in classroom practices that help them develop critical reflection by using reflective journaling, classroom dialogue, and critical questioning, while recognizing that becoming reflective is a developmental process requiring time and continuous practice (Taylor, 2008). The importance of developing an approach that is holistic alongside emphasis on relying on rational discusses and critical reflection is supported by research. Dirkx (2006) this all-inclusive approach appreciates the place of emotions and other ways of knowing (intuition, somatic), while emphasizing the place of relationships with others in the process of transformative learning. Dirkx (2006) posited that "through involving 'the whole person' into the classroom environment, we recognize the person in roundness of being: as an affective, intuitive, thinking, physical, spiritual self" (p. 46). Connecting the affective domain enables "an opportunity, for establishing a dialogue with those unconscious aspects of ourselves seeking expression through various images, feelings, and behaviors within the learning setting" (Dirkx, 2006, p. 22). In a classroom situation this means active and constant dialogue on the feelings of learners, in concert with reason, when fostering transformative learning. Other holistic approaches are;

- The importance of relationships with others in fostering transformative learning.
- Types of relationship found to be most significant for transformation are love relationships (enhanced self-image, friendship), memory relationships (former or deceased individuals), and

- imaginative relationships (inner-dialogue, meditation; Carter, 2002)

Eisen (2001) identified a "peer dynamic" this dynamic is reflected in several essential relational qualities: nonhierarchical status, non-evaluative feedback, voluntary participation, partner selection, authenticity, and establishment of mutual goals.

There are people who have no interest in transformation and consequently erect barriers that discourage and inhibit transformation; a variety of possible explanations exist for this. An online study involving adult learners explored how learners input meaning to their life histories through dialogue, a lack of interest in critical reflection as "group members failed to ask critical questions of one another nor challenge each other's assumptions, this lack of critique of each other could truncate group process prematurely" (Ziegler, Paulus, and Woodside, 2006, p. 315).

Chimera in 2006 explained that lack of interest in non-reflective learning can be manifested by learning preferences in the employment of reflective journaling. Some learners can be classified as non-reflectors after analyzing their journals as they seem to prefer discussing their history rather than writing them down.

Understanding barriers to transformative learning will help explain a lack of change among students. Examples of barriers are;

- imposing laws and punitive measures on welfare
- returnees to work in a family empowerment project (women) (Christopher, Dunnagan, Duncan, and Paul, 2001);
- uneven distribution of group responsibilities sometimes lead to downside experiences,
- undue emphases on task completion rather than reflective dialogue (Scribner and Donaldson, 2001);
- And lack of flexibility in role assignment (Taylor, 2003).

Teachers and educators are challenged to become creative and imaginative not only to prevent learners from developing resistance and barriers to transformative learning, in trying to understand learner readiness and willingness but to also ensure that those willing and able to change do so.

Studies reveal the impact life experience plays among learners and how learners susceptible to, are willing or possess the desire to change can achieve transformation (Cragg, Plotnikoff, Hugo, and Casey, 2001; Ziegahn, 2001). Beneficial life experience ought to be founded on a "deeper well" for those who need to tap from and respond to emerging dialogue between participants.

Conclusion

Transformative learning theory a continuously evolving genre of study for adult learning with substantial consequences for practice is growing in importance daily and it's being suggested in some circles that transformative learning could replace self-directed learning, andragogy and others as a dominant philosophy of Adult education providing teaching practices grounded in empirical research and supported by sound theoretical assumptions (Taylor, 2008).

The evolving alternative conceptions of transformative learning, which challenge scholars and educators to look far beyond transformative learning as defined by Mezirow, fresh insights are offered by these new alternative perspectives.

A lot is yet to be understood about transformative learning practice in the classroom despite the growth and interest generated to understand transformative learning. The following represents student's role in the process of developing transformative learning.

- The expected role student's play in the process of transformative learning and their relationship to the adult educator should be defined.
- Outlying the implications of employing transformative learning in the classroom, for instance what are the expected relationship between students and their peers, between the educator, officers in the school, and the significant others?
- For now, very little is known as a fact on the impact of employing transformative learning outcomes on learners (grades, test scores). A well thought out and clearly defined support system is advised if and when transformative learning is recognized and adopted in schools.
- The burgeoning interest and research in alternative learning theories ought to remind educators that developing transformative learning should be perused as being more important than implementing some instructional strategies with adult learners.

The core of transformative learning remains appropriately educating from a specific worldview, and educational philosophy. Taylor (2008), it is not an easy way to teach. Though, the potential is high for great

rewards for both the teacher and the learner, a great deal of work and courage is demanded as both are likely to be transformed during the transformative learning process" (Taylor, 2006, p. 92).

References

Boyd, R. D., and Meyers, J. G "Transformative Education." *International Journal of Lifelong Education,* 1988, *7*, 261–284.

Brookfield, S. "Racializing the Adult Education." *Harvard Educational Review,* 2003, *73*, 497–523.

Brooks, A. "Cultures of Transformation." In A. L. Wilson and E. R. Hayes (eds.), *Handbook of Adult and Continuing Education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000.

Carter, T. J. "The Importance of Talk to Midcareer Women's Development: A Collaborative Inquiry." *Journal of Business Communication,* 2002, *39,* 55–91.

Chimera, K. D. "The Use of Reflective Journals in the Promotion of Reflection and Learning in Post-Registration Nursing Students." *Nurse Education Today,* 2006, *27*, 192–202.

Christopher, S., Dunnagan, T., Duncan, S. F., and Paul, L. "Education for Self-Support: Evaluating Outcomes Using ." *Family Relations,* 2001, *50*, 134–142.

Continuing Education, no. 74. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1997.

Courtenay, B., Merriam, S. B., and Reeves, P. M. "The Centrality of Meaning-Making in Transformational Learning: How HIV-Positive Adults Make Sense of Their Lives." *Adult Education Quarterly,* 1998, *48*, 65–84.

Cragg, C. E., Plotnikoff, R. C., Hugo, K., and Casey, A. "Perspective Transformation in RN-to-BSN Distance Education." *Journal of Nursing Education,* 2001, *40*(7*),* 317–322.

Cranton, P. "Individual Differences and Transformative Learning." In J. Mezirow and   Associates (eds.), *Learning as Transformation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000.

Daloz, L. *Effective Teaching and Mentoring: Realizing the Transformational Power of Adult*

Dirkx, J. "   in the Practice of Adult Education: An Overview." *PAACE Journal of Lifelong Learning,* 1998, *7*, 1–14.

Dirkx, J. "Transformative Learning and the Journey of Individuation." *ERIC Digests,* 2000, no. 223. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service no. ED448305.)

Dirkx, J. M. (2006). "Engaging Emotions in Adult Learning: A Jungian Perspective on Emotion and Transformative Learning." In E. W. Taylor (ed.), *Teaching for Change*. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, no. 109. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2006.

Eisen, M. J. "Peer-Based Professional Development Viewed Through the Lens of Trans-formative Learning." *Holistic Nursing Practice,* 2001, *16,* 30–42.

formative Learning in Action: Insights from Practice. New Directions for Adult and

Freire, P. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed.* New York: Continuum, 1984.

Freire, P., and Macedo, D. P. "A Dialogue: Culture, Language, Race." *Harvard Educational Review,* 1995, *65*, 377–402.

Hussayn, U, I and Ahmadu, S, A, (2016) Quest *Journal of Medical and Dental Science Research Volume 4~ Issue 7 (2016) pp: 42-50ISSN(Online) : 2394-076X ISSN (Print):2394-0751* www.questjournals.org

Janik, D. S. "What Every Language Teacher Should Know About the Brain and How It Affects Teaching." Paper presented at Wikipedia 2007 Conference on Foreign Language Pedagogy, University of Helsinki, Finland, 2007.

Janik, D. S. *Unlock the Genius Within*. Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2005.

Johnson-Bailey, J., and Alfred, M. "Transformational Teaching and the Practices of Black Women Adult Educators." In E. W. Taylor (ed.), *Fostering Transformative Learning in the Classroom: Challenges and Innovations.* New Directions in Adult and Continuing Education, no 109. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2006.

Kegan, R. *In over Our Heads.* Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1994. Kreber, C. "An Analysis of Two Models of Reflection and Their Implications for Educational Development." *International Journal for Academic Development,* 2004, *9*, 29–49.

Lange, E. "Transformative and Restorative Learning: A Vital Dialectic for Sustainable Societies." *Adult Education Quarterly,* 2004, *54*, 121–139.

Learning Experiences. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1986.

MacLeod, R. D., Parkin, C., Pullon, S., and Robertson, G. "Early Clinical Exposure to People Who Are Dying: Learning to Care at the End of Life." *Medical Education,* 2003, *37*,   51–58.

Merriam, S. B. (ed.). *The New Update of Adult Learning Theory*. New Directions of Adult and Continuing Education, no. 89. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2001.

Merriam, S. B. "The Role of Cognitive Development in Mezirow's Transformational   Learning Theory." *Adult Education Quarterly,* 2004, *55*, 60–68.

Mezirow, J. "Contemporary Paradigms of Learning." *Adult Education Quarterly,* 1996, *46,* 158–172.

Mezirow, J. "Perspective Transformation." *Adult Education,* 1978, *28,* 100–110.

Mezirow, J. "Transformation Theory of Adult Learning." In M. R. Welton (ed.), *In Defense of the Lifeworld*. Albany: SUNY Press, 1995.

Mezirow, J. "Transformative Learning: Theory to Practice." In P. Cranton (ed.), *Trans-*

Mezirow, J. *Transformative Dimensions of Adult Learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass,

Mezirow, J., and Associates (eds.). *Learning as Transformation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000.

O'Sullivan, E. *Transformative Learning: Educational Vision for the 21st Century*. London: Zed Books, 1999.

Scribner, J. P., and Donaldson, J. F. "The Dynamics of Group Learning in a Cohort: From Non learning to Transformative Learning." *Educational Administration Quarterly,* 2001, *37*, 605–638.

Sheared, V. "Giving Voice: An Inclusive Model of Instruction A Womanist Perspective." In E. Hayes and S.A.J. Colin III (eds.), *Confronting Racism and Sexism in Adult Education*. New Directions for Continuing Education, no. 61. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1994.

Taylor, E. W. (1993). *A Learning Model of Becoming Interculturally Competent: A Trans-formative Process*. Unpublished dissertation, University of Georgia.

Taylor, E. W. (ed). "The Challenge of Teaching for Change." In E. W. Taylor (eds.), *Teaching for Change: Fostering Transformative Learning in the Classroom.* New Directions in Adult and Continuing Education, no. 109. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2006.

Taylor, E. W. (2007). An Update of: A Critical Review of the Empirical Research (1999–2005)." *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 26*(2), 173–191.

Taylor, E. W. "Attending Graduate School in Adult Education and the Impact on Teaching Beliefs: A Longitudinal Study." *Journal of Transformative Education,* 2003, *1*(4), 349–368.

Taylor, E. W. "Transformative Learning: A Critical Review." *ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education* (Information Series no. 374), 1998.

Tennant, M. C. "The Psychology of Adult Teaching and Learning." In J. M. Peters and P. Jarvis and Associate (eds.), *Adult Education: Evolution and Achievements in a Developing Field of Study*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991.

Tisdell, E. J. "Feminism." In L. M. English (ed.), *International Encyclopedia of Adult Education*. London: Palgrave, 2005.

Tisdell, E. J. *Exploring Spirituality and Culture in Adult and Higher Education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2003.

Williams, S. H. "Black Mama Sauce: Integrating the Theatre of the Oppressed and Afro-centricity in Transformative Learning." In C. A. Wiessner, S. R. Meyer, N. L. Pfhal, and P. G. Neaman (eds.), *Proceedings of the Fifth International Conference on Transformative Learning*, 2003.

Ziegahn, L. "'Talk' About Culture Online: The Potential for Transformation." *Distance Education,* 2001, *22,* 114–150.